

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

*A structured academic controversy*

## **The Reading Guide**

**DIRECTIONS:** Access the section titled “How Should America Fight the Great War in the Meuse-Argonne?” Examine the information in this section, and use that info to take notes on this page.

Which weapons represented the U.S.’s strategy of open warfare?

Which weapons represented trench warfare and the modern war mindset?

Why did U.S. General John J. Pershing favor hand-to-hand combat over trench warfare?

What does Sgt. Donald D. Kyler say that supports Pershing’s fighting philosophy?

How does Colonel John H. Parker’s report challenge Pershing’s support of traditional military tactics?

Historians continue to debate Pershing’s strategy. Some say the aggressive, offensive nature of open warfare was the jolt that a three-year-old stalemate needed. Other historians assert that if Pershing had used artillery and machine guns as more than just auxiliary weapons, there might have been fewer American casualties. What do you think? Was Pershing’s judgment right or wrong? Explain your answer below in at least 3 sentences.

Pershing was \_\_\_\_\_ because...

*A structured academic controversy*

## The Reading Guide – ANSWER KEY for TEACHER

DIRECTIONS: Access the section titled “How Should America Fight the Great War in the Meuse-Argonne?” Examine the information in this section, and use that info to take notes on this page.

Which weapons represented the U.S.’s strategy of open warfare?

**Bayonets**

Which weapons represented trench warfare and the modern war mindset?

**Machine guns, specifically the French-made M1915 Chauchat**

Why did U.S. General John J. Pershing favor hand-to-hand combat over trench warfare?

**Early in his military career, Pershing roamed the Great Plains, participating in many skirmishes with Indian tribes. Because of these experiences, he grew to favor hand-to-hand, rush-forward combat over trench warfare. Fighting in trenches, he said, caused soldiers to rely too heavily on machine guns, grenades, and artillery, which weakened their will to fight.**

What does Sgt. Donald D. Kyler say that supports Pershing’s fighting philosophy?

**Kyler said in recording that U.S. leaders wisely chose to train U.S. troops to use bayonets. He said that during battle, it is the infantry’s job to close in on the enemy, assault him, and destroy him. This is what war is all about, he said.**

How does Colonel John H. Parker’s report challenge Pershing’s support of traditional military tactics?

**Parker said in the recording that the “day of the rifleman is done.” “The bayonet is fast becoming as obsolete as the cross brow,” he said. Parker trained U.S. troops to use machine guns.**

Historians continue to debate Pershing’s strategy. Some say the aggressive, offensive nature of open warfare was the jolt that a three-year-old stalemate needed. Other historians assert that if Pershing had used artillery and machine guns as more than just auxiliary weapons, there might have been fewer American casualties. What do you think? Was Pershing’s judgment right or wrong? Explain your answer below in at least 3 sentences using facts and evidence from page 2.

Pershing was \_\_\_\_\_ because...

**STUDENTS MUST USE EVIDENCE FROM PAGE 2 TO JUSTIFY OPINION**

*A structured academic controversy*

**THE DEBATE QUESTION:**

**Was General Pershing's embrace of open warfare tactics what World War I needed to end the stalemate, or did Pershing's strategy lead to more U.S. casualties than there needed to be?**

**SIDE A:**

Pershing's open warfare gave the stalemate a jolt and was what World War I needed.

**SIDE B:**

Pershing's open warfare caused more casualties than there needed to be.

**Step 1 – Partners prepare – 20 minutes**

Partners will examine the content in the section titled "How Should America Fight the Great War in the Meuse-Argonne?". During this examination, they will find evidence that supports their side of the argument. As they find evidence, they will fill out the handout on the next page to organize their evidence. If partners want, they can also search for other Web sources beyond this section.

**Step 2 – Position presentation – 3 minutes for each step = 12 minutes**

- a. Side A presents their position using supporting evidence from their handouts.
- b. Side B restates Side A's position to Side A's satisfaction. In other words, Side B says, "What I hear you saying is \_\_\_\_\_."
- c. Side B presents their position using supporting evidence from their handouts.
- d. Side A restates Side B's position to Side B's satisfaction. In other words, Side A says, "What I hear you saying is \_\_\_\_\_."

**Step 3 – Consensus-building – 20 minutes**

Side A and Side B abandon their sides, and the group of 4 uses all of the evidence available to come to their best answer to the debate question. Then, all students must write this answer on their graphic organizer handout.

Name:

Date:

DEBATE ORGANIZER:

**Was General Pershing's embrace of open warfare tactics what World War I needed to end the stalemate, or did Pershing's strategy lead to more U.S. casualties than there needed to be?**

DIRECTIONS: Access the section titled "How Should America Fight the Great War in the Meuse-Argonne?" Examine the information in this section, and use that info to take notes that organize your debate. Fill out only the side that you were assigned.

<b><u>SIDE A:</u></b> <b>Pershing's open warfare gave the stalemate a jolt and was what World War I needed.</b>	<b><u>SIDE B:</u></b> <b>Pershing's open warfare caused more casualties than there needed to be.</b>
<i>Summary of piece of evidence 1:</i>	<i>Summary of piece of evidence 1:</i>
<i>Summary of piece of evidence 2:</i>	<i>Summary of piece of evidence 2:</i>
<i>Summary of piece of evidence 3:</i>	<i>Summary of piece of evidence 3:</i>

**What was the group's consensus?** Write at least four complete sentences below to describe what was your best answer to the debate question, and why you decided on this answer. Be prepared to present your consensus to the class.